## Habilitation à Diriger des Recherches Turbulent Limits

ALEXAKIS, Alexandros

16-03-2015

Many thanks to ...

#### • The Jury

Laurette TUCKERMAN, Annick POUQUET, Sergey NAZARENCO, William MATTHAEUS, Stephan FAUVE, Marc-Etienne BRACHET, Thierry ALBOUSSIERE

#### • The students

Benjamin MIQUEL, Santiago Jose BENAVIDES, Kannabiran, SESHASAYANAN, Giorgos MOMFERATOS

#### Paris

Francois PETRELIS, Basil GALLET, Nicolas MORDANT, Alexandra TZELLA, Martin SCHRINNER, Emmanuel DORMY, Vassilios DALLAS, ...

#### Nice

Yanick PONTY, Helen POLITANO, Barbara BIGOT, ...

#### Boulder

Anick POUQUET, Pablo MININNI, Duane ROSENBERG, Jai SUKHATME, Aime FOURNIER, Jonathan GRAHAM, ...

#### Woodshole

Charles DOERING, Phil MORISSON ...

#### Chicago

Robert ROSNER, Yuan-Nan YOUNG, Jim TRURAN, Fausto CATTANEO, Alan CALDER, Jonathan DURSI, Ed BROWN ...

SQA

## The work presented in the report



MHD turbulence



Universality with: Vassilios DALLAS



Dynamo



Mixing with: Alexandra TZELLA



Elastic waves with: Benjamin MIQUEL & Nicolas MORDANT



Intermittency with: Francois PETRELIS



Rotating turbulence



Inverse cascades with: Kanna SESHASAYANAN, Santiago BENAVIDES

## The work that will be presented today: Inverse Cascades



#### Kannabiran SESHASAYANAN, Santiago Jose BENAVIDES



MHD turbulence





Rotating turbulence ・ロト・日本・モート・モーシーモー つくで

- An introduction to turbulence
- Forward and Inverse cascades
- Inverse cascades in MHD turbulence
- Inverse cascades in rotating turbulence
- A model problem: 2D MHD
  - Global Quantities
  - Spectra and Fluxes
  - Fields
- Conclusions

## Turbulence is met everywhere...

Astrophysics, Atmospheric physics, weather prediction, geophysics, engineering, aviation, Industry, ...



## The problem of (3D hydrodynamic) turbulence

Incompressible Navier-Stokes

$$\partial_t \mathbf{u} + \mathbf{u} \cdot \nabla \mathbf{u} = -\nabla P + \nu \Delta \mathbf{u} + \mathbf{F}, \qquad \nabla \cdot \mathbf{u} = 0, \qquad +B.C.$$







Sir George Gabriel Stokes, (1819-1903)

One non dimensional control parameter:  $Re = \frac{U_{rms}L}{rms}$ 



Osborne Revnolds 1842-1912

Turbulence obtained at the  $Re \to \infty$  limit.

- Chaotic system
- Many degrees of freedom
- Injection of energy at one scale by F dissipation of energy at an other scale by viscosity

## The problem of (3D hydrodynamic) turbulence

Energy dissipation =  $\epsilon \equiv \nu \langle (\nabla \mathbf{u})^2 \rangle = \langle \mathbf{u} \cdot \mathbf{F} \rangle$  = Energy injection

#### The conjecture of turbulence

$$\lim_{\nu \to 0} \nu \langle (\nabla \mathbf{u})^2 \rangle > 0$$

by an ever increasing amplitude of the gradients of u due to the transfer of energy to smaller scales by the nonlinearity.



## The problem of (3D hydrodynamic) turbulence

Energy dissipation =  $\epsilon \equiv \nu \langle (\nabla \mathbf{u})^2 \rangle = \langle \mathbf{u} \cdot \mathbf{F} \rangle$  = Energy injection

#### The conjecture of turbulence

$$\lim_{\nu \to 0} \nu \langle (\nabla \mathbf{u})^2 \rangle > 0$$

by an ever increasing amplitude of the gradients of u due to the transfer of energy to smaller scales by the nonlinearity.



## 2D hydrodynamic turbulence

Energy dissipation =  $\epsilon \equiv \nu \langle (\nabla \mathbf{u})^2 \rangle = \langle \mathbf{u} \cdot \mathbf{F} \rangle$  = Energy injection

#### 2D turbulence dissipation

$$\lim_{\nu \to 0} \nu \langle (\nabla \mathbf{u})^2 \rangle \propto \nu u_{rms}^2 / L^2$$

No transfer of energy to smaller scales.



## Why 2D turbulence cascades energy inversely?



11/62

HDR

#### Forward and Inverse cascades

#### 3D Turbulence and 2D Turbulence



3D simulations at  $4096^3$ 



#### Energy condensation in 2D turbulence



#### Intermediate cases

#### There are some systems ...



- Fast rotating flows ( $Ro \equiv U/\Omega \ell \ll 1$ )
- Flows in the presence of a magnetic field ( $M \equiv U/B_0 \ll 1$ )
- Confined flows (thin geometries) ( $\Gamma \equiv h/\ell_f \ll 1$ )
- Helical MHD flows ( $h_M \equiv$  helicity injection/energy injection  $\cdot k_f$ )

• ...

for which the inverse cascade depends on a parameter

$$\mu = Ro, \Gamma, M, h_{\scriptscriptstyle M}, \ldots$$

#### Motivation

Fluxes in: Thin layers/Rotating/Stratified/Magnetic fields ...



- A. Celani, S. Musacchio, and D. Vincenzi, Phys. Rev. Lett. 104, 184506 (2010)
- A. Alexakis, Phys. Rev. E 84, 056330 (2011)
- A. Sen, P. D. Mininni, D. Rosenberg, and A. Pouquet Phys. Rev. E 86, 036319 (2012)
- A. Pouquet and R. Marino, Phys. Rev. Lett. 111, 234501 (2013)
- R. Marino, P. D. Mininni, D. Rosenberg, A. Pouquet European Phys. Lett. 102 44006 (2013)
- E. Deusebio, G. Boffetta, E. Lindborg, S. Musacchio, Phys. Rev. E 90, 023005 (2014)
- A. Sozza, G. Boffetta, P. Muratore-Ginanneschi, S. Musacchio, arXiv:1405.7824(2014)
- D. Byrne, H. Xia, M. Shats Phys. Fluids 23, 095109 (2011)
- H. Xia, D. Byrne, G. Falkovich, M. Shats Nature Physics 7, 321-324 (2011)
- M. Shats, D. Byrne, H. Xia Phys. Rev. Lett. 105, 264501 (2010)

SQA

## A turbulence to turbulence transition ...



- the system transitions from one turbulent state (inverse cascading) to an other (forward cascading) varying a parameter μ. (μ is not Re)
- the transition occurs in the presence of turbulent noise
- these transitions are not only observed as dimensional (ie 2D to 3D), but weak to strong, HD to MHD, ...
- these transitions are not only observed for the energy cascade but also for other invariants (magnetic helicity, square vector potential, wave action, ...)

## First example: MHD with a strong uniform magnetic field



 $\begin{array}{rcl} \mathsf{MHD} \text{ equations} \\ \partial_t \mathbf{u} + \mathbf{u} \cdot \nabla \mathbf{u} &= & B \partial_z \mathbf{b} & -\nabla P & + \mathbf{b} \cdot \nabla \mathbf{b} + \nu \Delta \mathbf{u} + \mathbf{F}_{\mathbf{u}} \\ \partial_t \mathbf{u} + \mathbf{u} \cdot \nabla \mathbf{b} &= & B \partial_z \mathbf{u} & + \mathbf{b} \cdot \nabla \mathbf{u} + \eta \Delta \mathbf{b} \end{array}$ 

## First example: MHD with a strong uniform magnetic field



$$\mathbf{B}$$

 $\begin{array}{rcl} \partial_t \mathbf{u} + \mathbf{u} \cdot \nabla \mathbf{u} &=& B \partial_z \mathbf{b} & -\nabla P & + \mathbf{b} \cdot \nabla \mathbf{b} + \nu \Delta \mathbf{u} + \mathbf{F}_{\mathbf{u}} \\ \partial_t \mathbf{u} + \mathbf{u} \cdot \nabla \mathbf{b} &=& B \partial_z \mathbf{u} & & + \mathbf{b} \cdot \nabla \mathbf{u} + \eta \Delta \mathbf{b} \end{array}$ 

Large  $B_0$  forces the flow to be 2-dimensional. The transition from 2D to 3D occurs when the largest mode becomes unstable:

$$B/L_{box} \sim U/\ell$$

## First example: MHD with a strong uniform magnetic field



#### As B is increased

- the flux towards the large scales increases
- the flux towards the small scales decreases
- below a value of *B* there is no visible flux to the large scales

#### Second example: Turbulence with a twist

#### **Rotating Navier-Stokes**



 $\partial_t \mathbf{u} + \mathbf{u} \cdot \nabla \mathbf{u} + 2\Omega \times \mathbf{u} = -\nabla P + \nu \Delta \mathbf{u} + \mathbf{F}, \qquad \nabla \cdot \mathbf{u} = 0, \qquad +B.C.$ 

## Rotating turbulence (Taylor Green Forcing)







 $\partial_t \mathbf{u} + \mathbf{u} \cdot \nabla \mathbf{u} + 2\Omega \times \mathbf{u} = -\nabla P + \nu \Delta \mathbf{u} + \mathbf{F}, \quad \nabla \cdot \mathbf{u} = 0, \quad +B.C.$  $\nabla \times \cdots \Rightarrow$ 

 $\partial_t \mathbf{w} + \mathbf{u} \cdot \nabla \mathbf{w} + 2\Omega \partial_z \mathbf{u} = \mathbf{w} \cdot \nabla \mathbf{u} + \nu \Delta \mathbf{w} + \nabla \times \mathbf{F}, \qquad \mathbf{w} = \nabla \times \mathbf{u},$ 

The transition from 2D to 3D occurs when the largest mode becomes unstable:

 $\Omega \sim U/\ell$  or  $Ro \equiv U/\Omega L \simeq 1$ 

## Large scale condensates

How an inverse cascade saturates (in the absence of large scale dissipation)





at saturation the flow forms condensates and moves Ro to the **critical** value:  $Ro = U/\Omega L \simeq 1$ where the inverse cascade stops

The system is attracted to the marginal inverse cascade state!

## Spectrum and fluctuations of condensates

#### At steady state:



• At the condensate state large & small scales co-exist

- Flux to the large scales  $\simeq 0$
- Large fluctuations of the flux (noise)

Previous models had a varying inverse cascade of energy due to a dimensional transition from a 3D to a 2D

Previous models had a varying inverse cascade of energy due to a dimensional transition from a 3D to a 2D

Thus they require 3D high resolution numerical simulations.

Previous models had a varying inverse cascade of energy due to a dimensional transition from a 3D to a 2D

Thus they require 3D high resolution numerical simulations.

Are there computationally more tractable models that show a transition from forward to inverse cascade?

#### Breaking the enstrophy conservation

The inverse cascade of energy in 2D is solely due to enstrophy  $\langle (\nabla \times {\bf u})^2 \rangle$  conservation.

#### Breaking the enstrophy conservation

The inverse cascade of energy in 2D is solely due to enstrophy  $\langle (\nabla \times {\bf u})^{\bf 2} \rangle$  conservation.



Figure from A. Celani, S. Musacchio, and D. Vincenzi,

Phys. Rev. Lett. 104, 184506 (2010)

Energy spectra of in-plane and out-of-plane velocity components

#### Breaking the enstrophy conservation

The inverse cascade of energy in 2D is solely due to enstrophy  $\langle (\nabla \times {\bf u})^2 \rangle$  conservation.



Kinetic and magnetic energy spectra In a 2D MHD simulation

#### Equations:

$$\partial_t \omega + \mathbf{u} \cdot \nabla \omega = + \left[ \nu_n^+ \nabla^{2n} \omega + \nu_n^- \nabla^{-2n} \omega \right] + F_\omega$$

where

$$\omega = \hat{\mathbf{e}}_n \cdot \nabla \times \mathbf{u}$$

Nonlinearity conserves

$$E = \frac{1}{2} \int \mathbf{u}^2 dv, \qquad \Omega = \frac{1}{2} \int \omega^2 dv$$

E

E

#### Equations:

$$\partial_t \omega + \mathbf{u} \cdot \nabla \omega = \mathbf{b} \cdot \nabla j + [\nu_n^+ \nabla^{2n} \omega + \nu_n^+ \nabla^{-2n} \omega] + F_\omega \partial_t a + \mathbf{u} \cdot \nabla a = + [\eta_n^+ \nabla^{2n} a + \eta_n^- \nabla^{-2n} a] + F_a$$

#### where

$$\boldsymbol{\omega} = \hat{\mathbf{e}}_n \cdot \nabla \times \mathbf{u}, \quad \mathbf{b} = \nabla \times (\hat{\mathbf{e}}_n a), \quad j = \hat{\mathbf{e}}_n \cdot \nabla \times \mathbf{b}$$

#### Nonlinearity conserves

$$E = \frac{1}{2} \int \mathbf{u}^2 + \mathbf{b}^2 dv, \qquad A = \frac{1}{2} \int a^2 dv$$

E

E

#### Equations:

$$\begin{array}{lll} \partial_t \omega + \mathbf{u} \cdot \nabla \omega &=& \mathbf{b} \cdot \nabla j + [\nu_n^+ \nabla^{2n} \omega + \nu_n^+ \nabla^{-2n} \omega] + F_\omega \\ \partial_t a + \mathbf{u} \cdot \nabla a &=& + [\eta_n^+ \nabla^{2n} a + \eta_n^- \nabla^{-2n} a] + F_a \end{array}$$

#### where

$$\omega = \hat{\mathbf{e}}_n \cdot \nabla \times \mathbf{u}, \quad \mathbf{b} = \nabla \times (\hat{\mathbf{e}}_n a), \quad j = \hat{\mathbf{e}}_n \cdot \nabla \times \mathbf{b}$$

Nonlinearity conserves

$$E = \frac{1}{2} \int \mathbf{u}^2 + \mathbf{b}^2 dv, \qquad A = \frac{1}{2} \int a^2 dv$$

• we will use the hypodissipation  $\eta_n^- \nabla^{-2n}$  to avoid condensates

• we will use the hyperdiffusion  $\eta_n^- \nabla^{-2n}$  to extend the inertial range:n=2.



$ \mathbf{F}_u  > 0,  \mathbf{F}_b = 0$	$ \mathbf{F}_u  > 0,   \mathbf{F}_b  > 0$	$\mathbf{F}_u = 0, \  \mathbf{F}_b  > 0$
Inverse cascade of E	?	Forward cascade of E
Forward cascade of $\Omega$	?	not conserved
Forward cascade of A	?	Inverse cascade of A

What is the fate of the forward/inverse cascade as we vary  $F_u, F_b$ ?

5900

Э

Э

#### Set-up of Numerical Experiments



2D square periodic box of side  $2\pi L$ No mean magnetic field  $\langle {\bf b} \rangle = {\bf 0}$ 

$$F_{\omega}(x,y) = f_u k_f^{+1} \sin(k_f x) \sin(k_f x)$$
  
$$F_a(x,y) = f_b k_f^{-1} \cos(k_f x) \cos(k_f x)$$

Control Parameters / Non-dimensional Numbers

$$\begin{split} \mu_f &\equiv \frac{f_b}{f_u} \\ k_f L & Re_f^- = \frac{f_u^{1/2} k_f^{1/2+2n}}{\nu_n^-} & Re_f^+ = \frac{f_u^{1/2} k_f^{1/2-2n}}{\nu_n^+} \\ P_M^- &\equiv \nu_n^- / \eta_n^- = 1, & P_M^+ \equiv \nu_n^+ / \eta_n^+ = 1 \end{split}$$

## Limiting procedure



• Fix  $Re_n^+$ , vary  $\mu_f$  for different box sizes  $(Re_n^-, k_f L)$ 

• Fix box size  $(Re_n^-, k_f L)$  vary  $\mu_f$  for different values of  $Re_n^+$ ,

## **Global Quantities**

DQC

## Quantifying the cascades

Inverse and Forward cascades of energy:

$$\begin{split} \epsilon_{\scriptscriptstyle E}^- &\equiv \nu_n^- \langle (\nabla^{-n} \mathbf{u})^2 + (\nabla^{-n} \mathbf{b})^2 \rangle, \qquad \epsilon_{\scriptscriptstyle E}^+ \equiv \nu_n^+ \langle (\nabla^{+n} \mathbf{u})^2 + (\nabla^{+n} \mathbf{b})^2 \rangle \\ \epsilon_{\scriptscriptstyle E} &\equiv \epsilon_{\scriptscriptstyle E}^- + \epsilon_{\scriptscriptstyle E}^+ \qquad \qquad 0 \leq \frac{\epsilon_{\scriptscriptstyle E}^-}{\epsilon_{\scriptscriptstyle E}} \leq 1, \end{split}$$

Inverse and Forward cascades of square vector potential:

$$\begin{split} \epsilon_A^- &\equiv \nu_n^- \langle (\nabla^{-n} a)^2 \rangle, \qquad \epsilon_A^+ \equiv \nu_n^+ \langle (\nabla^{+n} a)^2 \rangle \\ \epsilon_A^- &\equiv \epsilon_E^- + \epsilon_E^+ \qquad \qquad 0 \leq \frac{\epsilon_A^-}{\epsilon_A} \leq 1, \end{split}$$

Varying  $\mu_f$  for different box-size and fixed  $Re_n^+$ .



#### A Critical transition



critical behavior:

$$\epsilon_E^- \propto (\mu_{c_E} - \mu)^{\gamma_E}$$
 and  $\epsilon_A^- \propto (\mu - \mu_{c_A})^{\gamma_A}$ 

a best fit leads to:

 $\mu_{c_E} \simeq 0.22 \dots, \ \gamma_E \simeq 0.82 \quad \text{and} \quad \mu_{c_A} \simeq 0.25 \dots, \ \gamma_A \simeq 0.27$ 

#### Critical point dependence on $Re_n^+$

Varying  $\mu_f$  for different values of  $Re_n^+$  and fixed box-size.



• 
$$\mu_c = \mu_c(Re_n^+)$$

## Critical point dependence on $Re_n^+$ (rescaling)

Varying  $\mu_f$  for different values of  $Re_n^+$  and fixed  $Re_n^-$ .



•  $\mu_c \propto (Re_n^+)^{-1/2n}$ 

## Critical point dependence on $Re_n^+$ (rescaling)

Varying  $\mu_f$  for different values of  $Re_n^+$  and fixed  $Re_n^-$ .



• 
$$\mu_c \propto (Re_n^+)^{-1/2n}$$

Magnetic tension determines the transition:

$$\mu_b \equiv \frac{b^2 k_f}{f_u} \propto \mu_f^2 \left(\frac{k_d^+}{k_f}\right)^2 \propto \mu_f^2 [Re^+]^n$$

## Energy distribution among scales

#### Large scale spectra



#### Small scale spectra

Varying  $\mu_f$  for  $Re_n^+ \gg 1$ .



DQC

#### Small scale dissipations



For small  $\mu$ 

- magnetic energy at the smallest scales is  $b_\ell^2 \propto \mu^2 \ell_d^{-2}$  (passive advectio)
- kinetic energy at the smallest scales is  $u_{\ell}^2 \propto \epsilon_{\Omega}^{2/3} \ell_d^2$  (enstrophy cascade)

Nonlinearity starts when

$$\mu \ge \mu_{\scriptscriptstyle NL} \propto \ell_d^2 \propto R e^{-1/n}$$

#### Variable forward and backward fluxes



#### Instantaneous and time averaged fluxes

Strong fluctuations of the energy fluxes .....



## Fields

E

< □ ▶ < □ ▶ < □ ▶ < □ ▶ < □ ▶

 $\mu \ll \mu_{\scriptscriptstyle NL}$ 



Vorticity

#### Current density

▶ ▲圖 ▶ ▲ 臣 ▶ ▲ 臣 ▶ …

DQC

E

 $\mu_{\scriptscriptstyle NL} \lesssim \mu \ll \mu_c$ 



Vorticity

#### Current density

▶ ▲圖 ▶ ▲ 臣 ▶ ▲ 臣 ▶ 二 臣

DQC

 $\mu_{\scriptscriptstyle NL} \ll \mu \ll \mu_c$ 



Vorticity

#### Current density

▲部 医・ ● 田 ト

 $\mu_{NL} \ll \mu \lesssim \mu_c$ 



Vorticity

#### Current density

- ( 母 ) ( き ) ( き ) ( き

$$\mu = 0.21 \dots \lesssim \mu_c$$



Kinetic energy

#### Magnetic energy

- 4 □ → 4 □

$$\mu = 0.21 \cdots \lesssim \mu_c$$



Kinetic energy

#### Vector Potential

→ < Ξ →</p>

$$\mu = 0.26 \cdots \gtrsim \mu_c$$



Kinetic energy

#### Magnetic energy

< □ > < □ >

$$\mu = 0.26 \cdots \gtrsim \mu_c$$



Kinetic energy

#### Vector Potential

< /₽ > < ∃ >



- Transitions from forward to inverse cascades (IC) are common in turbulence
- The transition to IC can be critical
- In the absence of large scale dissipation (some) IC saturate at the marginal state for an IC
- 2D MHD is the first model to demonstrate that this transition happens through a critical point.
- New theoretical venues open for expansions around the critical point

# Thank you for your attention!

## A cartoon summary



- 4 □ → 4 □

→ < Ξ →</p>

990

Э

## A cartoon summary I



・ロト ・ 日 ・ ・ ヨ ・ ・ ヨ ト

## A cartoon summary II



5900

3

《曰》《聞》《臣》《臣》

## A cartoon summary III



・ロト ・部 ト ・ヨト ・ヨト

5900

э

## A cartoon summary IV



《口》《聞》《臣》《臣》

## A cartoon summary V



990

3

《曰》《聞》《臣》《臣》

## A cartoon summary VI



5900

Э

< ロ > < 同 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ >

#### Break down of the enstrophy conservation



HDR